



Cathy Hoog, Executive Director

Main Office and Public Housing Department  
27 Charter Street, Salem, MA 01970

Section 8 Department & Procurement/Modernization  
136 Canal Street, Suite 2, Salem, MA 01970

Telephone: 978-744-4431 Fax: 978-744-9614  
Website: www.salemha.org

**REVISED MINUTES OF THE  
REGULAR MEETING  
WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 13, 2023  
6:00 p.m.**

---

**I. Called Meeting to Order at 6:00**

**II. Roll Call**

Present

Charity Lezama  
John A. Boris  
Veronica Miranda  
Carly McClain  
Aaron Paternoster

Absent

Also Present: Cathy Hoog, Executive Director, Gary Dean, Director of Maintenance, Debra Tucker, Assistant Executive Director, Anne Cameron, Executive Assistant, Jacqueline Guzman, Director of Leased Housing, and Maureen Thomas, Director of Public Housing

**III. Minutes of Previous Meeting(s)**

Carly McClain: Can I vote on the motion for the minutes even though I was not at the meeting?

Veronica Miranda: I believe that you can if you have read them and feel comfortable with them.

John A. Boris moved to accept the Minutes of the Special Meeting held on Wednesday, November 15, 2023. Veronica Miranda seconded the motion and the roll call vote was as follows:

Ayes

Charity Lezama  
John A. Boris  
Veronica Miranda  
Carly McClain  
Aaron Paternoster

Nays



#### **IV. Tenant/Public Engagement**

Sue Kirby – I do not have anything to say.

Charity Lezama – Is there anyone online?

Cathy Hoog – I do not see anybody so no, Chair.

#### **V. Report of the Executive Director**

- See Executive Director's Report Attached – December 2023

Cathy Hoog: Good evening, everyone. Happy December. As always, there is a lot of information in your packages. We have our usual monthly data reports. I can highlight some of that information. Cathy reviewed her Executive Director Report in detail with the Board. If there are any additional questions, Board Members, I would be happy to go over anything.

Veronica Miranda – The 1.3 million was that the ARPA funding? Did you say that before you said that the spreadsheet was in the packet this month?

Cathy Hoog – The spreadsheet that I slipped into the packet this month outlines a stretch from January 2024 which is the anticipated closing for Leefort up to 2047, It would be a 20-year lookout of the monies that we'll get as a result of that deal. The \$1.3 million is the developer fees paid to us. There is an initial chunk that we get at closing and then at 50% construction completion, we get more. At a 100% and as the project is stabilized and ready to do our lease up, we get another chunk and that adds up to a little over \$1.3 million.

Veronica Miranda – Thank you for clarifying that. In terms of the ARPA money that came from the City, I think it was around that amount as well. I was wondering if the City put any restrictions on that money.

Cathy Hoog - Yes, and it is pretty extensive. It is a 4-page document that outlines how it can be spent and what it can be spent on. We are able to access some of the funds for pre-development but we have to record how it gets used and the timeframe in which it needs to be used is all outlined in the grant agreement. There are a lot of restrictions.

Veronica Miranda – I was going to say awesome, but...

Cathy Hoog – It is to be expected with any type of state or federal funding, there are all sorts of regulatory compliance that comes along with it. We are no strangers to that.

Veronica Miranda – I would love to see that grant agreement.

Cathy Hoog – Sure thing. If you could note that for me, Anne.

Charity Lezama – One other thing to know as I am transitioning off the Board, we have to look at how the non-profit is set up.

Cathy Hoog – Like who is on that Board. I am not sure if we named anyone or we just put in positions. I think it may be just positions. We will have to talk about that in the coming year. It needs to begin to become active, which would mean board meetings. Not necessarily every month. They could be quarterly or maybe even twice a year in the beginning. I will plan to talk about that in that coming year in January or February 2024.

Charity Lezama – Moving on to communications – Is there any questions or comments? One thing I want to highlight is that I asked Cathy to include one of the state guidelines and an outline about how we fill the Board. Veronica sent an email encouraging all of us to take a more active role and recommending and recruiting people to apply and be supportive. Since there are some new board members, I thought that it would be good for us all to understand how the positions are filled from a local level and a community level as well and what the guidelines are, what the term limits are for each and how many applicants they are encouraged to review (at least 2 but not more than 5). I wanted to include that for all of us as we start to transition.

## **VI. Communications**

- Updated Waitlist
- SHA Department Reports ( Move In, Move Out, State and Federal, CHAMP Report, Modernization Report, Voucher Report, Family Self-Sufficiency Report, Resident Service Coordinator Reports, and Completed Work Orders for Month of November 2023)
- Rent Reasonableness Study

Cathy Hoog – I also included information requested 2 board meetings ago. We had a discussion about fair market rents in relation to the flat rents that we were setting for a federal public housing program and we were able to follow up with a rent reasonableness study for all of our federal unit types. That is included in your board packets this month. It outlines the estimated market rent that is reasonable for these types of units and you will see that we did run the report for each type of federal unit that we have. If you have any questions on that, I would be happy to answer them. The values were pretty high. It is a testament to our market and the way things are going in this market. What is performed in a rent reasonableness study is the unit is inspected and we enter all of the information into a software program that includes the location, the amenities, how many bedrooms, the square footage and whether there is parking or not and laundry onsite, etc. The program then helps to accumulate all of the data in comparison to the area properties and then it spits out a number for us. That information is there for you for your information. I know we talked about it at length a few meetings ago. It is good news and I think our flat rents are incredible reasonable in comparison to the rent reasonableness for these units that we have. I think you can feel solid about the vote to accept those flat rents after looking at this. I am happy to answer any questions you may have.

Veronica Miranda – In terms of and I know it is very confusing. There are people who have section 8 and then there are all of the other vouchers that are possible.

Cathy Hoog – It is confusing. We have section 8 vouchers and within the section 8 program we have different types of vouchers. Then we have federal public housing which is the same as state public housing. They are developments, but they are just funded by the federal government. There is a different set of regulations that we have to adhere to. There are a lot of similarities between the state and federal regulations but there are some stark differences. The Federal Regulations would also apply to the section 8 program and all of those different types of vouchers that are under the section 8 program because that is a federal funded program.

Veronica Miranda – Federal Housing in terms of the inspections, they are different from the section 8 inspections?

Cathy Hoog – They are performed by different people. We have an inspector that primarily works for the section 8 program and then we have an inspector that would inspect state, and federal housing programs. Sometimes they help each other out. Part of the federal regulations require a different person to do a percentage of inspections so that we can compare and contrast in our SEMAP evaluation which allows us to ensure that our inspectors are getting similar, if not the same, results as somebody else. They do interchange a bit but primarily work in different programs.

Veronica Miranda – That is what the similarity percentage means here? I was wondering about that. Why does it say similarity and then credibility?

Jacqui Guzman – When we do the rent comparable, what the program does is it searches for similar, non-assisted units and the similarity means that 162 federal street is 91.86 86% similar to the 73 Boston Street apartment 2. The credibility is that whoever uploaded this information, it is 99% credible. These are just comparing them to our subject unit.

Cathy Hoog – Thank you Jacqui.

Jacqui Guzman – No problem.

Charity Lezama – Any other questions on the communications?

Veronica Miranda – To add to the flat rents and may that will be something that we discuss later on next year, my understanding is that there was not some type of rent reasonableness study done on public housing units.

Cathy Hoog – We did them on the Federal Public Housing because the flat rent only applies to federal public housing and when we had the discussion, we talked about doing the rent reasonableness on those units so that we could compare it to the flat rents that we were voting on. We could do rent reasonableness on public housing units. We could if we

decided that there was a reason for that. I think we would probably see some comparable numbers but yes, we could do that.

Veronica Miranda – I thought there was a flat rent for state public housing as long as people choose that.

Cathy Hoog – It is a little bit of a different procedure. I think you may be thinking if they are over income. Is that correct, Maureen?

Maureen Thomas – you have to be within a certain guideline. So, there isn't any flat rent option.

Cathy Hoog – There is no option. The regulations are confusing especially when you go back and forth from state and federal.

- Public Housing Notice – Tenant Board Member Procedures
- Budget Guidelines

## **VII. Reports of the Committees**

There were no reports of the Committees.

## **VIII. Recommendations of the Chair**

There were no recommendations of the Chair.

## **IX. Report of the Treasurer**

### Bills and Transfers

Veronica Miranda – I know that this is for the month of November, but I see Ben on the bills and transfers and I was wondering how that works because I know that we get paid quarterly but wondering how this works if his name keeps coming up on the bills and transfers for November.

Cathy Hoog – It was probably for the previous quarter. The accountant is usually a little bit behind with that. So, it is January through March, April through June, and July through September. It was probably through just the end of that quarter. The number is a little less.

Veronica Miranda – It is the same number that we received in November and so that confused me. Thank you for helping me understand that.

Charity Lezama moved to approve the bills and transfers for the period October 1, 2023 through October 31, 2023 as presented. John A. Boris seconded the motion and the **roll call** vote was as follows:

#### Ayes

Charity Lezama

John A. Boris

#### Nays

Veronica Miranda  
Carly McClain  
Aaron Paternoster

**X. Unfinished Business**

- Salem Housing Authority – By Laws Discussions

Charity Lezama – Under other business, we have the bylaws again. I think last month we had a discussion and we voted to move it forward. We have 2 changes. From my perspective if we were to vote on these 2 changes, I would vote no for the same reasons that I had last month. One of them being there needs to be clarity around what the board's role is within that section 14 and then on the last one, section 8, adding on to the Executive Director. I don't know that I feel that that language is necessary and I am open to discussion on that.

Aaron Paternoster – I had some changes I had wanted to add but I was a bit confused about the process. So, if we wanted to delay this vote, I would understand but I also understand that this needs to be settled this evening.

Charity Lezama – we can push it to next month, Aaron, if you want to get those changes in to Anne and then she could get them to everyone to review before the next board meeting.

Aaron Paternoster – I will defer as I know that this is something that you all have been working on for a while. If there is an appetite for more delay, I understand as well.

Charity Lezama – Does anybody else have any questions or comments on that preference and allowing Aaron to make his recommendation and vote next month?

Veronica Miranda – I do not have a preference. I think it is probably worth holding off and maybe even a bit longer than January, just in terms of the replacement. I am totally fine with that.

Charity Lezama – We can consider this an unfinished business matter for a while.

Cathy Hoog – To Veronica's point, there were multiple discussions that if board members had changes, they needed to be in by a certain amount of time to give board members the opportunity to review their suggestions so keep that in mind if there are additional changes. Please forward them to us and we can distribute them in a timely fashion to the rest of the board in fairness and according to the rules.

Veronica Miranda – I would just like to add that when we are making changes, we can use the strike out because it is easier to see the suggested changes.

Cathy Hoog – Agreed.

**XI. New Business**

## Election of New Chair of the Board of Directors of the Salem Housing Authority

Charity Lezama – Before I open this up for discussion because my term is ending after this meeting and somebody will be replacing me in January. Ben was the Vice Chair so we have to talk about a few things. I was able to do a little research and I know that there is an option if you all didn't want to make a permanent decision, you could make a temporary decision with the clear definition of timeline. That is an option for my position and until somebody new is in the seat before we make any kind of leadership decisions. I know that there is a lot of opportunities for discussion on this. One thing that we wanted to discuss is to talk about it before we voted on anyone or talked about anyone taking on the role: is what are we looking for in a Board Chair? To fill all of the gaps that I don't have.

Carly McClain – One thing that I would like a board chair to do is to facilitate the meeting . I know that sometimes we get topics that we have a lot of differences of opinion on so a person can keep moving it along so that the conversation is productive and simple. That is really key and a big part of why I joined and why I remain on a couple of boards. I am really selective about where I participate because I think that it is important work and that we move things along. That is crucial to me. I think also one of the reasons that I would have any interest in it is because I like to participate. Although I have been very tired tonight, it has been a very long week for me. I do like to participate and I don't think I would do a great job facilitating the meeting and moving things along. I know what my weaknesses are. It is helpful to me to have a strong chair that also keeps me focused and moving things along.

Aaron Paternoster – Something that I would be looking for in a Board Chair is the prep work that goes into these meetings. I personally do not have the bandwidth to dive in as me as I would hope someone that leading this body would. I would be looking for someone who has the time and the resources to review and go over and really set up a good agenda for us.

Charity Lezama – thank you.

Veronica Miranda – I do not know if this is a more formal thing but I think that Robert's rules can really be helpful in terms of the efficiency and productivity of the meetings. We can discuss that as a group if that is something that we want to be stricter about. That would be helpful.

Charity Lezama – I can say just from sitting in this seat for a little bit more than a year. I, too had concerns about my bandwidth, and ability to manage a meeting and where I don't believe that I have always been able to provide a hundred percent and it is achievable and Anne and Cathy make it really accessible for me to be able to prepare as well as I can so that I am able to sit and lead the meetings. I encourage you to think about it. It is an important role on this board. I don't think we have to make a permanent decision tonight. We will make a temporary one, but as you guys are going into it and as a new board member join, I encourage everyone to consider taking a turn. It doesn't have to be for your 5-year term. You can do it in short stints. It is an important role and it is somebody that works closely with Cathy to move the business along and to put together the agenda so I would be open to nominations for a temporary positions to take over but

Aaron did take over Ben's vice chair position so if we wanted to go by that direction we could do that or if somebody wants to step up and do it temporarily we can set a 2 month parameter on it. It would only be for January and February when we welcome on a new board member.

Aaron Paternoster: Are you referring to the vice chair or chair?

Charity Lezama – We need somebody to Chair the January and February meetings. So, all of the things that you all talked about I am hoping that someone will step up with the intent of just supporting the role for 2 months while we are on board a new board member.

Carly McClain – We can't do a rolling share can we, where we each take a meeting to see if any of us have an affinity for it?

Charity Lezama – Thank you. I think that might be challenging as there are signing responsibilities.

John Boris – Would you consider staying for the next few months?

Charity Lezama – My seat is done. As far as I am aware, the mayor is putting somebody else forward that will start in January.

Cathy Hoog – Hopeful January. It could be February depending on the timing of the interviews and then they have to go before the City Council. Aaron, I think when you heard vice chair, Charity mentioned that you had taken Ben's seat as vice chair.

Aaron Paternoster: Correct, I mean I would be comfortable with a vice chair position as somebody who can step up as needed, occasionally but I am not comfortable with the Chair position. Do we agree that if we go the temporary route that 2 months is the initial timeline? Is that something that you all agree on or do we agree on a temporary basis as well? I am just trying to get all of the easier decisions out of the way first.

Charity Lezama – This is my last voting month so, in my opinion, I think it would be thoughtful if you did a temporary 2 or 3 months appointment that would allow for a new position to come in. You don't know the skill set of the person coming in and it would be a more informed decision for a long term. That is just my opinion.

Aaron Paternoster – I would feel most comfortable and Veronica, please don't get upset but fortunately you have the burden of seniority and you are most familiar right now between the 4 of us. I don't know.

Charity Lezama – All in agreement that a temporary 3-month appointment -Veronica is that something you would be willing to do?

Veronica Miranda – I would be willing to do that for 3 months.



Charity Lezama moved to elect Veronica Miranda as Temporary Chair of the Board of Directors of the Salem Housing Authority for the period January 2024 through March 2024. John A. Boris seconded the motion and the roll call vote was as follows:

Ayes

Charity Lezama  
John A. Boris  
Carly McClain  
Aaron Paternoster

Nays

Veronica Miranda abstained from voting.

Charity Lezama – Thanks Veronica.

New Hire – Finance Director

There were four (4) candidates chosen to be interviewed for the open position of Finance Director. Cathy Hoog interviewed the two (2) candidates. Two of the candidates who were chosen to be interviewed decided to withdraw from being interviewed. Cathy will present her candidate of choice.

Cathy Hoog – Board members I presented a resume to you tonight for consideration for the position of Director of Finance. I am very pleased to say that this is an internal candidate and that she has been with our agency for over 10 years and has been a tremendous asset to the authority. She is in graduate school presently for accounting and she has experience in federal public housing, state public housing, section 8, she is very familiar with the financial aspects of all of the programs within our agency and we know her very well and I am confident in the person and the capability that I would be receiving as a result working with her. I am very pleased to present her to you for consideration, Massiel Garcia this evening. If you have any questions, I am happy to answer them.

Carly McClain – Her resume and credentials are great and match. To have somebody that can already use your computer systems like that is huge and already working on staff at the agency.

Charity Lezama – she has been with the agency a long time.

Cathy Hoog – Yes, and she has moved up. It is wonderful for me as a leader and it's important for me as well to support staff and encourage staff, encourage education and growth and when people move on within or outside of our agency it is truly exciting and rewarding to see that. It brings me great pleasure to see her advancing in this direction.

Veronica Miranda – seconded the motion --- can we deliberate on that? I wanted to ask, is this a new position?

Cathy Hoog – It is a new position. I spoke about this at our last meeting or the meeting before. Considering the up-and-coming growth of our nonprofit, and the overall growth of our agency actually, we are in dire need of this position. We definitely are growing which is wonderful. We

have two people currently. One full-time and one part-time person in our finance department and myself. It has been a lot to manage. All of the financial aspects of all of the different programs that we serve and now we are adding another non-profit to our repertoire. To bring somebody in at this time makes total sense and it is really quite necessary for us just in terms of managing.

Charity Lezama – are you advertising her current position?

Cathy Hoog – Yes, we would need to advertise. It can be really great because there is an opportunity for people from within to apply and potentially be promoted. It is a win, win that way as well.

Veronica Miranda - In terms of the starting salary, I do not know where she is at right now but I am curious as to what the differences are in her salary are now and that salary and what the average starting salaries are.

Cathy Hoog – This is on the lower end. As a new Director of Finance, the salary is in line with what an agency our size would offer someone with experience but not with years of experience with a Director of Finance. We see the salary range anywhere from \$100,000 to \$150,000.00 but it would be an increase for her from her current job. She is the Assistant Director of Public Housing and I believe she is around \$70,000.00. I am not positive on that as I don't have payroll in front of me.

Veronica Miranda: That seems to be a really large jump. Though I fully acknowledge that it is a different position.

Cathy Hoog: They are 2 totally different positions with a tremendous amount of responsibility as a director of finance.

Veronica Miranda – Just 1 more thing. I tried to look for what other communities have a Director of Finance. Do you know what communities have a Director of Finance?

Cathy Hoog – pretty much all communities do. Cambridge, Boston, Somerville, Chelsea, and Medford.

Veronica Miranda – I would personally be interested in looking at what other communities have. I want to be cautious about how we are spending public money when we have lots of projects and things like that. I want to be mindful about how we are spending it. That is where I am at and I am not suggesting that we put it off but those are my thoughts.

Cathy Hoog – setting the salaries, falls under the purview of the executive director. The overall budget is presented to the Board and also as presented by the fee accountant who monitors our monthly spending and our submissions to the state and federal government. I would not present a salary to the Board that wasn't in line with the industry standards. I wouldn't do that. It would not make sense for me to either present something that we could not afford or wasn't allowed by regulation because I sign a code of ethics and I carry a tremendous amount of responsibility to the financials so that is why it falls under my purview.

Veronica Miranda – That is really helpful. Thank you for sharing that. With that, my comments still stand. For you in terms of how we go forward and what new positions come up and how we are spending the public money mostly because of the projects and some of the dire needs for these developments. That is all I have to add.

John A. Boris moved to make a conditional offer of employment to Massiel Garcia for a full-time position as Finance Director at an annual salary of \$100,000.00 with a start date TBD.

Veronica Miranda seconded the motion and the **roll call** vote was as follows:

Ayes

Nays

Charity Lezama

John A. Boris

Carly McClain

Aaron Paternoster

Veronica Miranda abstained from voting.

#### New Hire – Section 8 Housing Inspector

There were two (2) candidates chosen to be interviewed for the open position of Section 8 Housing Inspector. Cathy Hoog, Jacqueline Guzman, and Sabrina Eschman interviewed the two (2) candidates. Cathy will present her candidate of choice.

Cathy Hoog – Board Members you have a resume in your package tonight for Paola Medina. She is somebody that we have had the opportunity to work with through Housing Opportunities Unlimited. She is actually an employee with Housing Opportunities Unlimited. That is the company that has been helping us with all the relocation for the Leefort Terrace residents. She is trained in HQS and follows through with doing HQS Inspections for new potential units for people that are being relocated. She has a responsibility of ensuring that there is a smooth transition for relocation. She assists the residents from start to finish throughout the process with moves, questions they have, providing support, coordinating movers, leases and everything that goes along with relocation. We have had the opportunity to work with her close to a year now. She is somebody that has impressed me from the moment I met her. When this position opened up, I told her about it and she was very interested. We are excited to present her as a hire for our Section 8 Housing Inspector. I think she would do a fabulous job. She is also bilingual and I would note that both of the candidates presented this evening are bilingual. She speaks Spanish and English. I think she would be a wonderful asset to our agency. I am happy to answer any questions you have. As a reminder we had an in-house housing inspector for quite some time and then we transitioned into contracting that out and it has been an okay experience but in comparison having someone in house in this position has been really valuable. We are looking to transition into an in-house position for this job.

Veronica Miranda – Is this person a person of color?

Cathy Hoog – I believe she identifies that way. Yes.

Veronica Miranda – I wanted to state how awesome it is to see women of color, people of color coming up and being in positions that historically people have been kept out of.

Aaron Paternoster – I personally appreciate any opportunity to bring people back in and I am glad to see this.

Cathy Hoog – Thank you. We are too.

Charity Lezama moved to make a conditional offer of employment to Paola L. Montes Medina with a six (6) month probationary period for a full-time position as Section 8 Housing Inspector at an annual salary of \$65,000.00 with a start date TBD. Employment is also conditioned upon receipt of a passed SHA paid physical examination including drug test and a favorable Criminal Offense Record Information (CORI) check. Veronica J. Miranda seconded the motion and the **roll call** vote was as follows:

Ayes

Charity Lezama  
John A. Boris  
Veronica Miranda  
Carly McClain  
Aaron Paternoster

Nays

Waiver for Removing Unit 403 Charter Street Off Line for Use as Supportive Living Office

Cathy Hoog discussed with the Board the necessity of a waiver for removing Unit 403, 27 Charter Street off line for use as a supportive living office.

Cathy Hoog – Unit 403 has been offline for approximately 15 years. The Charter Street development has a supportive living program which is essentially modified assisted living services. It is a partnership that the Housing Authority has with AgeSpan to provide on-site 24-hour support to the residents who live in this building. There is also a component to the program that involves meals on a daily basis. People come down and have community meals together and they have personal care attendants, nurses aides that are in the building around the clock and the program does require office space. Many years ago, when the grant was received in the program and inception began and the unit was taken off line for them for their office space but because it has been so long, it is time for an updated vote on ensuring that it is on record that the units can be taken offline for these purposes. Unfortunately, we do not have any other options for them. I wish we had more space in the building that was not a unit. They do need a private office space to be able to operate this program. This vote is more of a formality in that we have already given it to them and they are fully operational and, in the unit, and I can speak on behalf of the residents that benefit from the services. It has been tremendously helpful for many people in this building.

Charity Lezama – Are there any questions or comments?

Veronica Miranda – I am hearing that that unit has been off line for 15 plus years. I met somebody here and I believe his name is Frank and he does some work with the LTO and I do not

know if he is tied into this but I think that he is and I wanted to give him a “shout out” and say how great he is. I’m very supportive of this specifically and I did want to talk about this. I wanted to talk about offline units and I believe strongly that we should prioritize putting units back online for housing especially with our crisis right now and looking for other office space opportunities. I am very supportive of this.

Veronica Miranda moved to approve the waiver for removing Unit 403, 27 Charter Street off line for use as a supportive living office. John A. Boris seconded the motion and roll call vote was as following:

Ayes

Nays

Charity Lezama  
John A. Boris  
Veronica Miranda  
Carly McClain  
Aaron Paternoster

Grant Award Application for Additional Funding for 2023 Resident Service Coordinator to the Executive Office of Housing and Livable Communities (EOHLC)

Cathy Hoog presented the Grant Award Application for additional funding for the 2023 Resident Service Coordinator to the Executive Office of Housing and Livable Communities (EOHLC).

Cathy Hoog – We need to apply every year for an extension of our service coordinator funding and that required a board vote to go along with this submission. I wanted to thank Charter Street LTO and Leefort Terrace Tenants Organization as well as Morency Manor. Sue Kirby wrote a letter on behalf of the Morency Manor Tenants Organization in support of our application. The support is really appreciated. Thanks to the LTOs for their support on the application.

Charity Lezema moved to approve the Grant Award Application for additional funding the 2023 Resident Service Coordinator to the Department of Housing and Community Development. Veronica Miranda seconded the motion and the roll call vote was as follows:

Ayes

Nays

Charity Lezama  
John A. Boris  
Veronica Miranda  
Carly McClain  
Aaron Paternoster

Bid - Storm Door Replacement at Garden Terrace (200-1) EOHLC Project 258181

Aaron Paternoster – I am curious about the scope of the storm doors. Are we talking about just replacing the doors or are we removing frames? It seems a bit high.

Debbie Tucker - There are 32 units, front, and rear storm doors. It is replacing the storm doors and some trim work not completely replacing the trim work.

Gary Dean – There is also remediation in there as well.

Aaron Paternoster – There is? Okay. That makes much more sense.

Veronica Miranda – Can you clarify what you mean by remediation?

Gary Dean – Some of the mastics behind some of the trim is hot so there has to be a contractor on site when they do the demo just to make sure that they are not disrupting anything.

Veronica Miranda – Okay, thank you.

Cathy Hoog -- That term is used for asbestos and lead, products that are not supposed to be safe. They have to follow very strict procedures on how to manage that.

Veronica Miranda – Do we know how many of our doors have that issue?

Gary Dean – no I don't have that.

Cathy Hoog - We could only make assumptions based on the age.

Debbie Tucker – There was some testing done and so then since it is family housing that assumption is made for all of the doors. Safe procedures must be used.

Cathy Hoog – When the Architect or the engineer is developing specification for a job like this, they do go out and take a look and make evaluations and that is advertised in the bid so the people who are bidding on it know what to expect and they have to be qualified.

Veronica Miranda – Thank you for answering all of those questions.

Charity Lezama moved to accept the lowest responsive and responsible bid of \$98,850.00 from 3-A Construction Services, LLC for 258181 Storm Door Replacement at Garden Terrace (200-1) as reviewed and approved by the Executive Office of Housing and Livable Communities pending a positive reference check by the Architect, Andrew M. Brockway, and Associates. Veronica Miranda seconded the motion and the roll call vote was as follows:

Ayes

Charity Lezama  
John A. Boris  
Veronica Miranda  
Carly McClain  
Aaron Paternoster

Nays

#### Bid - Asphalt Shingle Roof Replacement at the Dalton Building (667-7B) EOHLC 258180

Carly McClain – she made some comments to the board.

Cathy Hoog – thank you.

Debbie Tucker – We could certainly word the vote a little bit differently and send the information along to EOHLC for further investigation.

Aaron Paternoster – Is this something that the city wage depth ordinance might cover?

Further discussion ensued among the Board Members.

Debbie Tucker – We could table this until next month and look further into this. EOHLC did vet them as well.

Charity Lezama – We will table this vote and come back to it in January.

The Board agreed to table this matter until the January 10, 2024 Board Meeting.

( ) moves to accept the lowest responsive and responsible bid of \$42,250.00 from Osgood Painting & Contracting Services for 258180 Asphalt Shingle Roof Replacement at the Dalton Building (667-7B) as reviewed and approved by the Executive Office of Housing and Livable Communities. ( ) seconds the motion and the roll call vote is as follows:

Ayes

Nays

Rejection of Bid from ERA Equipment LLC - Site Improvements at Pioneer Terrace (667-4)  
EOHLC Project 258167

The Salem Housing Authority is recommending rejection of the low bidder, ERA Equipment LLC, for 258167 Site Improvements at Pioneer Terrace (667-4). This recommendation is based upon unfavorable references as obtained by the Engineer, Beals & Thomas. In addition, the Salem Housing Authority's Director of Maintenance has had a previous unsatisfactory experience with this contractor. Gary Dean was the Director of Maintenance with the Ipswich Housing Authority and managed a walkway repaving projects by ERA Equipment LLC at one of the housing developments, Caroline Avenue. The work by ERA Equipment LLC was unsatisfactory, the quality was inferior requiring repairs, the project exceeded the Notice to Proceed without good cause, and communication by the contractor was poor.

Debbie Tucker – ERI Equipment out of Ipswich, MA came in with the lowest bid. We are asking for rejection of the bid based on the quality of the references we got back. The recommendation that we received from EOHLC was to reject the bid.

Aaron Paternoster – What is the next comparable bid?

Debbie Tucker – That would be the next recommendation – T4 construction and they came in at \$360,000.00. They are lower than the next 5 and seems to be in the range of what the designer thought the project would come in at.

Aaron Paternoster – They were happy with the references?

Debbie Tucker – Yes. References were checked on them and EOHLC is well involved in this one as well.

Aaron Paternoster – Okay, thank you.

John A. Boris moved to reject the bid of \$321,000.00 from ERA Equipment LLC for 258167, Site Improvements at Pioneer Terrace (667-4) based upon unfavorable previous experience with this contractor by the Salem Housing Authority's Director of Maintenance as well as unfavorable references as obtained by the Engineer, Beals and Thomas, Inc. Veronica Miranda seconded the motion and the roll call vote was as follows:

Ayes

Charity Lezama  
John A. Boris  
Veronica Miranda  
Carly McClain  
Aaron Paternoster

Nays

Cathy Hoog – We are recommending going with the next lowest eligible responsive bidder.

#### Bid -Site Improvements at Pioneer Terrace (667-4 for EOHLC Project 258167

The Salem Housing Authority recommended acceptance of the lowest responsive and responsible bid by T4 Construction LLC for 258167 Creative Placemaking, Site Improvements at Pioneer Terrace (667-4).

Charity Lezama moved to accept the lowest responsive and responsible bid of \$360,000.00 from T4 Construction LLC for 258167 Creative Placemaking, Site Improvements at Pioneer Terrace (667-4) pending approval by the Executive Office of Housing and Livable Communities and a positive reference check from the Engineer, Beals and Thomas, Inc. Veronica Miranda seconded the motion and the roll call vote was as follows:

Ayes

Charity Lezama  
John A. Boris  
Veronica Miranda  
Carly McClain  
Aaron Paternoster

Nays

#### Creative Placemaking, Site Improvements at Pioneer Terrace (667-4) EOHLC Project 258164

Debbie Tucker – We received 2 bids for this. Cassidy landscaping came in at \$378,822.00. They were vetted and the designer and EOHLC found their paperwork to be in order and their references to be good and we are recommending approval of the lowest bid.

Cathy Hoog – Long awaited projects at Pioneer Terrace. We are very pleased to see these projects get moving.

Veronica Miranda moved to accept the lowest responsive and responsible bid of \$378,822.00 from Cassidy Landscaping for 258164 Creative Placemaking, Site Improvements at Pioneer Terrace (667-4) pending approval by the Executive Office of Housing and Livable Communities.



John A. Boris seconded the motion and the roll call vote was as follows:

Ayes

Nays

Charity Lezama  
John A. Boris  
Veronica Miranda  
Carly McClain  
Aaron Paternoster

#### Pre-2004 Section 8 Monies

On August 8, 2012, the Board of Directors authorized the former Executive Director spend Pre-2004 Section 8 Reserve Monies up to Five Thousand (\$5,000.00) Dollars without further Board approval. Cathy Hoog, Executive Director requested the Board to restore the Five Thousand (\$5,000.00) Dollars using the same guidelines as the Board authorized on August 8, 2012.

Cathy Hoog – Board Members you may remember some years ago there was an agreement to request the use of Pre-2004 reserves \$5,000.00 at a time. We are presenting you with a summary of the latest expenditures and requesting another \$5,000.00 replenishment.

Veronica Miranda: I want to show my appreciation for the staff and I think it is important to celebrate and to applaud them for the work that they do all throughout the year. I do just want to say for the record, when it comes to certain things that we are doing for staff that maybe we can look for less expensive ways of bereavement or other types of celebrations. I think some of the things on here are really costly and I would just say that maybe we can look for some more affordable ways of doing that.

Charity Lezama moved to authorize Cathy Hoog to restore the Five Thousand (\$5,000.00) Dollars from the Section 8 Reserve Monies using the same guidelines as authorized by the Board on August 8, 2012. Veronica Miranda seconded the motion and the **roll call** vote was as follows:

Ayes

Nays

Charity Lezama  
John A. Boris  
Veronica Miranda  
Carly McClain  
Aaron Paternoster

#### Board of Directors' Meetings for the Calendar Year 2024

The regularly scheduled meetings of the Board of Directors for 2024 are as follows:

**Wednesday, January 10, 2024**

**Wednesday, July 10, 2024**

**Wednesday, February 14, 2024**

**Wednesday, August 14, 2024**

**Wednesday, March 13, 2024**

**Wednesday, September 11, 2024**

**Wednesday, April 10, 2024**

**Wednesday, October 09, 2024**

**Wednesday, May 08, 2024**

**Wednesday, November 13, 2024**

**Wednesday, June 12, 2024**

**Wednesday, December 11, 2024**

All Regular Board Meetings are held at 6:00 p.m. All Board Meetings will be held via Zoom and in person until further notice.

## **XII. Other Business/Late Communications**

Cathy Hoog – I want to publicly thank you Charity. It has been a pleasure to work with you for over 4 years. I personally just want to highlight how valuable to have your support. The staff wholeheartedly feels your support and your commitment to the business, the growth, and the productive nature in which you have been so encouraging and we will miss you.

Charity Lezama – Thank you.

All staff thanked Charity Lezama for her service.

Veronica Miranda – It has been great working with you, especially last year. I feel like we have spent some solid hours talking and trying to solve some things so I wanted to thank you for that.

Charity Lezama – Thank you. Thank you everyone.

Gene Collins – Pioneer Terrace, commented as follows:

- The minutes of the November 2023 minutes contained errors and there were things that should have been more fully expressed.

Charity Lezama – Gene, we already approved those minutes so you will have to come next month and raise your concerns and we are just about to adjourn the meeting.

## **XIII. Adjournment**

Charity Lezama moved that the Board adjourn the Regular Meeting of December 13, 2023 at 7:15 p.m. Veronica Miranda seconded the motion and the **roll call** vote was as follows:

Ayes

Charity Lezama

John A. Boris

Veronica Miranda

Carly McClain

Aaron Paternoster

Nays

Respectfully Submitted,



---

Cathy Hoog, Executive Director



---

Anne M. Cameron, Executive Assistant